

Appendix B

GROUPS AND INDIVIDUALS ASSOCIATED WITH EXXONMOBIL'S DISINFORMATION CAMPAIGN

Table 1 **Select ExxonMobil-Funded Organizations Providing Disinformation on Global Warming**¹⁷⁴

Organization	Total ExxonMobil Funding ¹⁷⁵ (1998–2005)	Illustrative Information
Africa Fighting Malaria	\$30,000	AFM received \$30,000 donation in 2004 for “climate change outreach.” This grant represents 10% of their total expenses for that year. AFM’s website has an extensive collection of articles and commentary that argue against urgent action on climate change. ¹⁷⁶
American Council for Capital Formation, Center for Policy Research	\$1,604,523	One-third of the total ExxonMobil grants to ACCF-CPR between 1998 and 2005 were specifically designated for climate change activities. ExxonMobil funds represent approximately 36% of their total expenses in 2005. ¹⁷⁷
American Council on Science and Health	\$125,000	ExxonMobil donated \$15,000 to ACSH in 2004 for “climate change issues.” A September 2006 Better Business Bureau Wise Giving Alliance Charity Report concludes that the ACSH does not meet all the standards for charity accountability. ¹⁷⁸
American Enterprise Institute	\$1,625,000	Lee R. Raymond, retired chair and CEO of ExxonMobil, is vice chairman of AEI’s Board of Trustees. ¹⁷⁹
American Friends of the Institute of Economic Affairs	\$50,000	American Friends of the IEA received a \$50,000 ExxonMobil donation in 2004 for “climate change issues.” This grant represents 29% of their total expenses for that year. The 2004 IEA study, <i>Climate Alarmism Reconsidered</i> , “demonstrates how the balance of evidence supports a benign, enhanced greenhouse effect.” ¹⁸⁰
American Legislative Exchange Council	\$1,111,700	Of the total ExxonMobil grants to ALEC, \$327,000 was specifically for climate change projects. ALEC received \$241,500 in 2005 from ExxonMobil.
Annapolis Center for Science-Based Public Policy	\$763,500	In 2002, ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 20% of their total expenses. The Annapolis Center’s climate work includes production of materials exaggerating the uncertainty about the human contribution to climate change. Climate contrarians Sallie Baliunas and Richard Lindzen serve as scientific advisors. ¹⁸¹
Arizona State University, Office of Climatology	\$49,500	The Office of Climatology at ASU received an ExxonMobil donation in 2001. Robert C. Balling, Jr., directed the office during this time. ¹⁸² ExxonMobil did not donate to any other offices of climatology between 1998 and 2005.
Atlantic Legal Foundation	\$20,000	The Atlantic Legal Foundation filed an <i>amicus</i> brief on behalf of climate contrarians, Sallie Baliunas, David Legates, and Patrick Michaels, in support of the EPA’s decision against the regulation of carbon dioxide emissions as a pollutant. ¹⁸³ The ALF received several ExxonMobil donations between 1998 and 2005.
Atlas Economic Research Foundation	\$680,000	Atlas Economic Research Foundation received \$65,000 in 1998 for a “global climate conference and other support.” In 2003, ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 6% of their total expenses for that year.
Cato Institute	\$105,000	In 2002, ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 0.2% of the total expenses.
Center for the Defense of Free Enterprise	\$230,000	From 2003 to 2005, ExxonMobil funds represent a significant percentage of the total expenses (2003: 61%, 2004: 143%, 2005: 95%). The largest grant (\$130,000 in 2004) was specified by ExxonMobil for “global climate change issues.”
Centre for the New Europe	\$170,000	ExxonMobil gave \$120,000 between 2004 and 2005 to support the centre’s climate change activities.
Center for the Study of Carbon Dioxide and Global Change	\$90,000	In 2003, ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 14% of total expenses.
Citizens for a Sound Economy Educational Foundation [became FreedomWorks]	\$380,250	CSE received \$275,250 from ExxonMobil in 2001, an increase from \$30,000 the year before. CSE merged with Empower America and became FreedomWorks in 2004. ¹⁸⁴ FreedomWorks maintains that the science of climate change is “far from settled” and cites scientists such as Sallie Baliunas. ¹⁸⁵

Table 1 **Select ExxonMobil-Funded Organizations Providing Disinformation on Global Warming**¹⁷⁴
continued

Organization	Total ExxonMobil Funding ¹⁷⁵ (1998–2005)	Illustrative Information
Committee for a Constructive Tomorrow	\$472,000	Approximately 23% of the total ExxonMobil funding for the CCT was directed by ExxonMobil for climate change activities. The 2004 ExxonMobil grant represented approximately a quarter of their total expenses for that year.
Competitive Enterprise Institute	\$2,005,000	Of the organizations analyzed, CEI received 1.2 times more money from ExxonMobil since 1998 than the second most-funded organization, AEI. In FY 2003, ExxonMobil grants represented approximately 16% of CEI's total expenses.
Congress of Racial Equality (CORE)	\$235,000	In 2004, ExxonMobil donated \$135,000 for climate change activities. This organization is not required to file an annual return with the IRS because its income is reportedly less than \$25,000 annually. ¹⁸⁶
Consumer Alert, Inc.	\$70,000	In 2004, the ExxonMobil grants for climate change “opinion leader and public education efforts” and climate change “outreach to opinion leaders” represented approximately 14% of their total expenses for that year.
Federalist Society for Law & Public Policy Studies	\$90,000	S. Fred Singer is a featured expert for the Federalist Society, which received funding from ExxonMobil every year from 2000 to 2005.
Foundation for Research on Economics and the Environment	\$210,000	FREE's federal judicial seminars in Montana, which were reported in a May 2006 <i>Washington Post</i> article as funded by ExxonMobil and other corporations, have been criticized for facilitating special interest lobbying. ¹⁸⁷ In 2004, ExxonMobil donated \$20,000 for a “climate seminar.”
Fraser Institute	\$120,000	All of the funds ExxonMobil donated to the Fraser Institute between 1998 and 2005 were for climate change work.
Free Enterprise Action Institute	\$130,000	The Free Enterprise Action Institute is registered under Steven Milloy's name and home address. In 2005, ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 64% of total expenses. Tax filings from 2004 and 2005 reported no staff.
Frontiers of Freedom Institute	\$1,002,000	A May 2003 <i>New York Times</i> article reported that the \$232,000 ExxonMobil donation in 2002 (up from \$40,000 the year before) represented approximately one-third of FFI's annual budget. Almost half of their total ExxonMobil donations since 1998 were specifically designated by ExxonMobil for climate change projects. ¹⁸⁸
George C. Marshall Institute	\$630,000	The George C. Marshall Institute has received a steady stream of funding from ExxonMobil for its climate science program: \$405,000 between 2001 and 2004. In 2004, ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 21% of total expenses. The Marshall Institute in turn donated \$12,602 to the Tech Central Science Foundation (Tech Central Station) in 2004. ¹⁸⁹
Heartland Institute	\$561,500	Nearly 40% of the total funds that the Heartland Institute has received from ExxonMobil since 1998 were specifically designated for climate change projects. ExxonMobil donated \$119,000 in 2005, its biggest gift to Heartland since 1998.
Heritage Foundation	\$460,000	ExxonMobil gave \$25,000 in 2002 for “climate change issues.”
Hoover Institution on War, Revolution, and Peace, Stanford University	\$295,000	ExxonMobil donated \$30,000 in 2003 for “global climate change projects.” Climate contrarians Sallie Baliunas and S. Fred Singer were Wesson Fellows for the Hoover Institute, a public policy research center. ¹⁹⁰
Independent Institute	\$70,000	Climate contrarians S. Fred Singer, David Legates, and Frederick Seitz are all research fellows at the Independent Institute, which has received money from ExxonMobil from at least 1998 to 2005.
Institute for Energy Research	\$177,000	The Institute received \$45,000 in 2004 for “climate change and energy policy issues” from ExxonMobil. In 2005, ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 31% of total expenses.
International Policy Network	\$295,000	The International Policy Network's largest grant from ExxonMobil since 1998, \$115,000 in 2004, was specifically designated for “climate change” activities. This grant represented 16% of their total expenses for that year.
Lindenwood University	\$10,000	In 2004, ExxonMobil donated \$5,000 for “climate change outreach.” Lectures publicized on the university's Institute for Study of Economics and the Environment, for example, question the human contribution to global warming. ¹⁹¹
Media Research Center	\$150,000	\$100,000 of the total funds the Media Research Center received from ExxonMobil between 1998 and 2005 were specifically designated for climate change activities.

Table 1 **Select ExxonMobil-Funded Organizations Providing Disinformation on Global Warming**¹⁷⁴
continued

Organization	Total ExxonMobil Funding ¹⁷⁵ (1998–2005)	Illustrative Information
Mercatus Center, George Mason University	\$80,000	ExxonMobil funded \$40,000 in 2004 to support the Mercatus Center's work on climate change regulation.
National Association of Neighborhoods	\$100,000	In 2004, an ExxonMobil grant for work on climate change issues represented approximately 6% of total expenses.
National Center for Policy Analysis	\$420,900	The NCPA received funding from ExxonMobil every year from 2000 to 2005. NCPA climate work includes, for example, a paper authored by climate contrarian David Legates that argued the arctic polar bear population was not threatened by global warming. ¹⁹² The NCPA also cites the work of Robert Balling, Jr., John Christy, and other climate contrarians.
National Center for Public Policy Research	\$280,000	In 2003, ExxonMobil gave the center \$30,000 to fund the EnviroTruth website (www.envirotruth.org), which purportedly provides information on the "truths and falsehoods" of a variety of environmental issues, including climate change. ¹⁹³
National Environmental Policy Institute	\$75,000	Steven Milloy is the former director of the NEPI. ¹⁹⁴ ExxonMobil funds in 2000 represented 3% of their total expenses that year. The activities of NEPI's Global Climate Science Project included a Congressional roundtable and white paper referencing several climate contrarians. ¹⁹⁵
Pacific Research Institute for Public Policy	\$355,000	PRI's largest donation from ExxonMobil since 1998 is \$100,000 in 2004 (up from \$45,000 for each of the two previous years). ExxonMobil allocated half of this grant for "climate change and environmental quality research."
Science and Environmental Policy Project	\$20,000	SEPP was founded by climate contrarian S. Fred Singer. ¹⁹⁶ ExxonMobil donated \$10,000 in 2000 for project support.
The Advancement of Sound Science Center, Inc.	\$50,000	ExxonMobil funds represented approximately 65% of total expenses in FY 2002.
Tech Central Station	\$95,000	The DCI Group ran TCS until TCS was sold in September 2006. ¹⁹⁷ The DCI Group is a registered ExxonMobil lobbying firm. ¹⁹⁸
Weidenbaum Center, Washington University (formerly Center for the Study of American Business)	\$345,000	Murray Weidenbaum, honorary chair, has written about the "great uncertainty" of the human contribution to global warming. ¹⁹⁹ The center received \$70,000 from ExxonMobil in 1998 for "Global Climate Change and other support" and published papers by climate contrarians Patrick Michaels (1998) and S. Frederick Singer (1999).

TOTAL: \$15,837,873

Table 2 **Scientific Spokespeople Affiliated with ExxonMobil-Funded Groups**

Name	Affiliation With ExxonMobil-Funded Organizations	Title/Role
Sallie Baliunas	Annapolis Center for Science Based Public Policy	<i>Science and Economic Advisory Council Member</i> ²⁰⁰
	Committee for a Constructive Tomorrow	<i>Academic and Scientific Advisory Board Member</i> ²⁰¹
	Competitive Enterprise Institute	<i>Report Author</i> ²⁰²
	George C. Marshall Institute	<i>Senior Scientist</i> , ²⁰³ and <i>Chair of Science Advisory Board</i> ²⁰⁴
	Global Climate Coalition	<i>Featured Scientist</i> ²⁰⁵
	Heartland Institute	<i>Writer/contributor</i> ²⁰⁶
	Heritage Foundation	<i>Writer/contributor</i> ²⁰⁷
	Hoover Institution on War, Revolution and Peace	<i>Robert Wesson Endowment Fund Fellow (1993-4)</i> ²⁰⁸
	Tech Central Station	<i>Science Round Table Member</i> ²⁰⁹
Robert C. Balling, Jr.	Cato Institute	<i>Book Author</i> ²¹⁰
	Committee for a Constructive Tomorrow	<i>Academic and Scientific Advisory Board Member</i> ²¹¹
	Heritage Foundation	<i>Policy Expert</i> ²¹²
	International Policy Network	<i>Writer/contributor</i> ²¹³
	Tech Central Station	<i>Science Roundtable Member</i> ²¹⁴
John Christy	Competitive Enterprise Institute	<i>Report and Article Authors</i> ²¹⁵
	Independent Institute	<i>Report Author</i> ²¹⁶
Hugh Ellsaesser	Committee for a Constructive Tomorrow	<i>Academic and Scientific Advisory Board Member</i> ²¹⁷
	Consumer Alert	<i>Advisory Council Member</i> ²¹⁸
Sherwood B. Idso	Center for the Study of Carbon Dioxide and Global Change	<i>President</i> ²¹⁹
	Committee for a Constructive Tomorrow	<i>Academic and Scientific Advisory Board Member</i> ²²⁰
	George C. Marshall Institute	<i>Report Author</i> ²²¹
David R. Legates	Competitive Enterprise Institute	<i>Former Adjunct Scholar</i> ²²²
	George C. Marshall Institute	<i>Report Author</i> ²²³
	Heartland Institute	<i>Featured Author</i> ²²⁴
	Independent Institute	<i>Research Fellow</i> ²²⁵
	National Center for Policy Analysis	<i>Adjunct Scholar and E-team Expert</i> ²²⁶
	Tech Central Station	<i>Science Roundtable Member</i> ²²⁷
Richard Lindzen	Annapolis Center for Science Based Public Policy	<i>Science and Economic Advisory Council Member</i> ²²⁸
	Cato Institute	<i>Contributing Expert</i> ²²⁹
	George C. Marshall Institute	<i>Report Author</i> ²³⁰

Table 2 **Scientific Spokespeople Affiliated with ExxonMobil-Funded Groups** continued

Name	Affiliation With ExxonMobil-Funded Organizations	Title/Role
Patrick J. Michaels	American Council on Science and Health	<i>Scientific Advisor</i> ²³¹
	American Legislative Exchange Council	<i>Report Author</i> ²³²
	Cato Institute	<i>Senior Fellow in Environmental Studies</i> ²³³
	Committee for a Constructive Tomorrow	<i>Academic and Scientific Advisory Board Member</i> ²³⁴
	Competitive Enterprise Institute	<i>CEI expert</i> ²³⁵
	Consumer Alert	<i>Advisory Council Member</i> ²³⁶
	George C. Marshall Institute	<i>Book Editor and Contributor</i> ²³⁷
	Heartland Institute	<i>Writer/contributor</i> ²³⁸
	Heritage Foundation	<i>Policy Expert</i> ²³⁹
	Tech Central Station	<i>Science Roundtable member</i> ²⁴⁰
	Weidenbaum Center	<i>Study Author</i> ²⁴¹
Fredrick Seitz	Atlantic Legal Foundation	<i>Director Emeritus</i> ²⁴²
	Committee for a Constructive Tomorrow	<i>Academic and Scientific Advisory Board Member</i> ²⁴³
	George C. Marshall Institute	<i>Chairman Emeritus and Member of the Board of Directors</i> ²⁴⁴
	Independent Institute	<i>Research Fellow</i> ²⁴⁵
	Science and Environmental Policy Project	<i>Chairman of the Board of Directors</i> ²⁴⁶
S. Fred Singer	American Council on Science and Health	<i>Scientific Advisor</i> ²⁴⁷
	Cato Institute	<i>Writer/contributor</i> ²⁴⁸
	Centre for the New Europe	<i>Featured Expert</i> ²⁴⁹
	Federalist Society for Law and Public Policy Studies	<i>Featured Expert</i> ²⁵⁰
	Frontiers of Freedom	<i>Adjunct Fellow</i> ²⁵¹
	Heritage Foundation	<i>Senior Fellow</i> ²⁵²
	Hoover Institution on War, Revolution and Peace	<i>Robert Wesson Endowment Fund Fellow and Featured Author</i> ²⁵³
	Independent Institute	<i>Research Fellow</i> ²⁵⁴
	National Center for Policy Analysis	<i>Adjunct Scholar</i> ²⁵⁵ and <i>E-team Expert</i> ²⁵⁶
	Science and Environmental Policy Project	<i>President</i> ²⁵⁷
Weidenbaum Center	<i>Study Author</i> ²⁵⁸	
Willie Soon	Fraser Institute	<i>Featured Expert</i> ²⁵⁹
	Frontiers of Freedom	<i>Chief Scientific Researcher for the Organization's Center for Science and Public Policy</i> ²⁶⁰
	George C. Marshall Institute	<i>Senior Scientist</i> ²⁶¹
	Heartland Institute	<i>Writer/contributor</i> ²⁶²
	Tech Central Station	<i>Science Roundtable member</i> ²⁶³

Table 3 **Key Personnel Overlap between Tobacco and Climate Disinformation Campaigns**

Person	Tobacco Company Affiliation	Climate Campaign Role*
Doug Goodyear	VP, Walt Klein and Associates, PR firm for R.J. Reynolds tobacco company (RJR) Cofounder, Ramhurst, an ostensibly grassroots organization for “smokers’ rights” that received funding from RJR ²⁶⁴	CEO, DCI Group, a registered ExxonMobil lobbying firm that created Tech Central Station, an on-line journal that publishes articles by climate contrarians. Director, Tech Central Science Foundation, funding arm of Tech Central Station ²⁶⁵
Timothy N. Hyde	Senior Director of Public Issues, RJR, 1988 to 1997 ²⁶⁶	Managing Partner, DCI Group
Steven Milloy	Headed The Advancement of Sound Science Coalition (TASSC), a group that the Philip Morris tobacco company covertly created in 1993 to manufacture uncertainty about the health hazards posed by secondhand smoke ²⁶⁷	Member, Global Climate Science Team (GCST), a group created in part by ExxonMobil that outlined an explicit strategy to invest millions of dollars to manufacture uncertainty on the issue of global warming ²⁶⁸ Home address listed for the slightly renamed The Advancement of Sound Science <i>Center</i> (TASSC) and the Free Enterprise Action Institute, both funded by ExxonMobil ²⁶⁹
Frederick Seitz	Employed by RJR to oversee the company’s medical research funding, 1979 to 1989 ²⁷⁰	Emeritus chair of the ExxonMobil-funded George C. Marshall Institute ²⁷¹ Wrote and circulated a letter asking scientists to sign a petition calling upon the U.S. government to reject the Kyoto Protocol ²⁷²
Tom Synhorst	Midwestern Field Coordinator, RJR ²⁷³	Chair, DCI Group

* Major climate campaign roles were identified; this is not a comprehensive list.